To: Environmental Protection Agency, EPA Docket Center (EPA/DC)  
Mailcode 28221T, Attention Docket ID No. OAR-2008-0699  
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20460

Re: Comments on Docket ID No. EPA-HQ-OAR-2008-0699

March 16, 2015

To Whom It May Concern:

The Northern California Prescribed Fire Council, Southern Sierra Prescribed Fire Council, and Central Coast Prescribed Fire Council represent diverse groups of fire managers, regulators, academics, tribes, and other parties who implement, research, or otherwise support the use of prescribed fire in California’s fire-adapted ecosystems. We are writing this letter to provide comments on the EPA’s proposed revisions to the ground-level ozone standards, and to outline potential implications for forest health, fuels management and wildfire hazard, and public health and safety.

We would like to preface our comments by highlighting our understanding of the health risks associated with ozone, and emphasizing our commitment to and concern for public health, especially as it relates to forest health and fire. As shown in the comments below, we do not dispute the regulation of ground-level ozone. However, we do see a need for the new rule to better articulate the natural role of fire in California’s ecosystems; to better clarify how natural fire regimes, cultural burning, proactive fuels management, and forest restoration will be addressed in the rule; and to better account for the inherent connections among fire, forest health, and public health.

Fire in California

Fire, ignited by lightning and Native Americans, has shaped the structure and composition of the majority of California’s ecosystems for millennia, and is indisputably a major component of natural background conditions in the state. Scott Stephens, a fire science professor at UC Berkeley, estimates that approximately 4.5 million acres burned every year in California prior to 1800—that’s just less than the average annual area burned in wildfires throughout the entire U.S. during the period 1994-2004, which was considered an extreme decade for wildfire. In California’s most abundant forest types, these historical fires were frequent and of limited intensity, consuming dead material and killing small trees, but leaving most large trees alive and intact. However, a century of fire suppression has led to significant shifts in forest composition, structure, and function, resulting in fires that are now uncharacteristically intense and lethal.

Despite increasing expenditures on fire suppression, these intense fires represent a growing proportion of the annual area burned in California’s forests, creating periods of severely degraded air quality, threatening human life and property, and altering the natural landscape, with implications for the conservation of threatened and endangered species.

Reversal of these trends requires the restoration and maintenance of forest conditions that once allowed for and were maintained by frequent, lower intensity fires. The scale of this task is immense, and fire itself, carefully and regularly applied under moderate conditions as either prescribed fire or managed wildfire, is the single most effective and efficient tool for restoring and maintaining forest health while protecting against future catastrophic fire and related threats to public health and welfare.
Considerations for the Rule

The proposed rule highlights the importance of prescribed fire in reducing wildfire severity and maintaining ecosystem function. As stated in the rule, “EPA understands the importance of prescribed fire, which mimics a natural process necessary to manage and maintain fire-adapted ecosystems and climate change adaptation, while reducing risk of uncontrolled emissions from catastrophic wildfires” (p. 75384). We commend the EPA for including this language in the proposed rule.

However, there are a number of gray areas in the proposed rule, and it would benefit from more detail and clarification on a number of issues, including 1) the role and benefits of fire more generally (including prescribed fire and managed wildfire), and its rightful categorization as a source of natural background emissions; 2) the need to protect and enable cultural burning practices by tribal communities; 3) how the use of beneficial fire will be affected by and/or protected within the control strategies mandated by the rule, given the stated benefits of its use; and 4) potential issues with relying on the Exceptional Events Rule as a primary method for restoring and maintaining fire on the landscape.

Prescribed fire and managed wildfire

As prescribed fire councils, our primary focus is the use of management-ignited prescribed fires that meet objectives outlined in a thorough, upfront planning process. There is broad agreement within both the management and scientific communities on the effectiveness and unique values of prescribed fire, which cannot be fully achieved through other, non-fire-based means. Cultural burning fits under this umbrella as well, and we would like to emphasize our support for tribal efforts to revitalize cultural burning practices.

However, we also understand the harsh reality of California’s current fire and fuels management backlog, where annual treatments to reduce wildfire hazard cover a mere fraction of the area that needs attention. In addition, we know that it is not feasible to fully address wildfire hazard—and resulting harmful emissions, including ozone—with management-ignited prescribed fires and mechanical treatments alone. Many areas are either too steep or too remote for mechanical treatments, or are designated wilderness, where fire is the only tool for maintaining forest resilience. As a result, we recognize the need to define beneficial fire more broadly, and to regard both prescribed fire and managed wildfire as important tools for bringing fire-adapted ecosystems in California and throughout the country into a more resilient condition.

To this end, we would like to see clear language and processes in the rule that address a broader definition of beneficial fire, including prescribed fire and managed wildfire. The natural role of fire should be highlighted in the rule, and it should be clearly stated that fire is not an unknown contributor (as classified now), but rather a natural process that is necessary to avoid larger exceedances and emissions-related health problems from uncontrolled and uncharacteristically severe wildfire. Furthermore, as outlined by the Western Regional Air Partnership (WRAP),¹ it is important to categorize cultural burning and ecological burning as natural background emissions sources, and treat them accordingly. We strongly believe that it is neither appropriate nor feasible to limit a natural process as part of a control strategy in a non-attainment area, especially when that process can produce long-term net benefits for the resources at risk. We hope that the EPA can develop guidance for non-attainment areas that clearly articulates these points, and gives local air districts direction and tools to exclude natural, beneficial fire from their control strategies. These actions would be in the long-term mutual interest of both forest health and public health.

Limitations of the Exceptional Events Rule

We see that the Exceptional Events Rule (EER) is cited in the proposed language as a potential pathway for exempting beneficial fire under the new standards. We are concerned about the ability of the EER to allow for natural, beneficial fire to play a role to the extent that it is needed. Currently, the EER only treats wildfire and prescribed fire as exceptions under very particular circumstances that are not necessarily consistent with restoration and management goals on the landscape. For example, the EER can be used to exempt fires that are one-time events and not expected to occur again at the same location, but this contradicts management needs, where repeated application is necessary to restore more frequent fire and maintain resilience. This reiterates the need for ecological and cultural burns to be classified as natural background emissions sources and treated differently than other industrial and anthropogenic sources. Also, the process to monitor and apply for the EER is cost prohibitive and cumbersome; this is especially true for prescribed fire, and as a result, the rule is rarely used for that purpose. To our knowledge, it has never been used to exempt prescribed fire in California.

As we pointed out above, beneficial fire should be the primary component of any practical strategy to restore and maintain forest resilience on a landscape scale and protect the public from severe wildfire events and related pollutants. It would be prudent to outline clear strategies that protect and enable the use of beneficial fire, rather than offering costly, cumbersome pathways that continue to treat fire as an inherently negative process only permissible under exceptional circumstances. We understand that the EER will be up for revision later this year, but we find it unwise to roll out the new standards under the assumption that a to-be-revised EER will take care of fire-related concerns. Clear language and protections for beneficial fire are needed now in the proposed ozone rule.

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on the revised rule and shed light on the critical connections between forest health and public health. Fire is an inevitable and natural part of California’s future, but the nature of that fire is in our hands. We hope that the EPA will offer a regulatory environment that specifically recognizes and enables the use of beneficial fire on the landscape, rather than promoting short-sighted or vague regulations that could make the existing problem worse.

Please feel free to contact us if you need any further information.

Sincerely,

Steering Committee members and other supporters of the Northern California, Southern Sierra, and Central Coast Prescribed Fire Councils, as listed below and on the following pages:

Lenya Quinn-Davidson, Director
Northern California Prescribed Fire Council
nwcapfc@gmail.com

Karina Silvas-Bellanca, Chair
Southern Sierra Prescribed Fire Council
sserrapfc@gmail.com

Nick Goulette
Chair, Northern CA Prescribed Fire Council
Executive Director, Watershed Research and Training Center
nickg@hayfork.net

Carl Skinner, Geographer (retired USFS)
Steering Committee Member
Northern CA Prescribed Fire Council
bmefguy@gmail.com

Eric Moore, Steering Committee Member
Central Coast Prescribed Fire Council
erdc2tails@mac.com

Christopher Mallek
Steering Committee Member
Southern Sierra Prescribed Fire Council
christopherrmallek@gmail.com
Jeff Kane, Professor, Humboldt State University  
Steering Committee Member  
Northern CA Prescribed Fire Council  
Jeffrey.kane@humboldt.edu

Eamon Engber, Interagency Fire Ecologist  
Redwood National Park and Six Rivers National Forest  
Steering Committee Member  
Northern CA Prescribed Fire Council  
eamon_engber@nps.gov

Bill Tripp, Karuk Tribe, Department of Natural Resources  
Steering Committee Member  
Northern CA Prescribed Fire Council  
btripp@karuk.us

Will Harling, Executive Director  
Mid Klamath Watershed Council  
Steering Committee Member  
Northern CA Prescribed Fire Council  
will@mkwc.org

Yana Valachovic, Forest Advisor & County Director  
UC Cooperative Extension, Humboldt/Del Norte  
Steering Committee Member  
Northern CA Prescribed Fire Council  
yvala@ucanr.edu

James K. Agee  
Emeritus Professor of Forest Ecology  
University of Washington  
Managing Editor, Fire Ecology  
jagee@uw.edu

Dr. Scott Stephens, Professor of Fire Science  
Co-Director, Center for Fire Research and Outreach  
University of CA, Berkeley  
ssstephens@berkeley.edu

Robert Sanders  
District Fire Management Officer  
USFS, Sequoia National Forest  
rssanders@fs.fed.us

Deakon J. Duey  
Resource Forester, RPF# 2853  
Humboldt Redwood Company, LLC  
dduey@hrcllc.com

Kristen Shive  
University of CA, Berkeley  
kshive@berkeley.edu

Marcia Penner Freedman  
Author: Fighting Fire in the Sierra National Forest (release 3/30/15)  
freedman@sti.net

John Buckley, Executive Director  
Central Sierra Environmental Resource Center  
johnb@cserc.org

Raul Recarey, CEO  
Karuk Tribe Health & Human Services  
recarey@karuk.us

Larry Luckham  
Resident, Marin County  
Larry.Luckham@cityofsanrafael.org

Tamara Hanna, Chair  
Southern California Society of American Foresters  
Tjh2ogal@yahoo.com

Robert Puls  
Agency Rep., Tulare County RCD  
President, Sequoia Fire Safe Council  
bob_puls@tularecountyrcd.com

Don Rivenes, Executive Director  
Forest Issues Group  
rivenes@sbcglobal.net

William Basye, Fuels Management Specialist  
Sequoia and Kings Canyon National Parks  
william_basye@nps.gov

Ramona J. Butz  
Northern Province Ecologist  
USFS, Klamath, Mendocino, Shasta-Trinity, and Six Rivers NFs  
rbutz@fs.fed.us

Brian Peterson  
Botanist, Vegetation Ecologist, and GIS Specialist  
Nomad Ecology  
peterson.n.brian@gmail.com
Andrew Spencer
USDA Forest Service
agordonspencer@gmail.com

Bruce Courtright, Chair
The National Center for the Elimination of Catastrophic Wildfire
bcourtright@sisqtel.net

Phillip Dye
Prometheus Fire Consulting
phil@prometheusfireconsulting.com

Rich Fairbanks
Fairbanks Forest Management, LLC
r_fairbanks@q.com

Dave Kahan
Full Circle Forestry
sparky@asis.com

Matt Berry
Adaptive Management Services Enterprise Team
USDA Forest Service
maberry50@yahoo.com

Josh Hiller, Emergency Services Coordinator
Firestorm WFS, Inc.
jhiller75@yahoo.com

Daniel Godwin
University of Missouri – Columbia
danielg7@gmail.com

Kyle Keegan
Educator and Land Restoration Practitioner
owlsperch@asis.com

Arielle Halpern
University of CA, Berkeley
arielle.halpern@berkeley.edu

Jose Luis Duce Aragues
Northern CA Prescribed Fire Council participant
jlducearagues@yahoo.es

Andrew Slack, Student
Humboldt State University
aslack@humboldt.edu

Colin W. Campbell, Student
Humboldt State University
colinwcamp@aol.com

Ryan DeSantis, Forest Advisor
University of California Cooperative Extension
rdesantis@ucanr.edu

Amy Ziegler
Interagency Fire Management Specialist – Planning
Six Rivers National Forest/Redwood National Park
aziegler@fs.fed.us

Randy Striplin, Fire Planner
USDA Forest Service
Lake Tahoe Basin Management Unit
rstriplin@fs.fed.us

Christina Restaino
University of CA, Davis
cmrestaino@ucdavis.edu

Rob York, PhD
Research Stations Manager, UC Center for Forestry
Adjunct Assistant Professor of Forestry
Department of Environmental Science, Policy, and Management
University of CA, Berkeley
rayork@gmail.com

Jack and Sara Kimmich, owners
Hydro Tech Transport
dirtdoctorjak@aol.com

Carmen Tubbesing, Graduate Student
UC Berkeley Wildland Fire Science Lab
cubbesing@berkeley.edu

Andrew Slack, Graduate Student
Humboldt State University
aslack@humboldt.edu

Madelinn Schriver, Graduate Student
Humboldt State University
madelinn.schriver@humboldt.edu
Laura Lalemand, Graduate Student
Humboldt State University
lbl12@humboldt.edu

Dan Stark, Staff Research Associate
University of CA Cooperative Extension
stark@ucanr.edu

Adam C. Watts, Ph.D.
Assistant Research Professor, Fire Ecology
Deputy Director, Program for Climate, Ecosystem, and Fire Applications (CEFA)
Division of Atmospheric Sciences
Desert Research Institute
adam.watts@dri.edu

Christopher Ruff, Fuels Officer
USDA Forest Service, Tahoe National Forest
cruff@fs.fed.us

Peter Kelly, Fire Management Officer
USFWS, San Luis National Wildlife Refuge Complex
peter_kelly@fws.gov

Keith Mayer, Fire Program Supervisory Range Tech
USFWS, San Luis National Wildlife Refuge Complex
keith_mayer@fws.gov

Tony Howard, Battalion 1114
CAL FIRE, Mendocino Unit
tony.howard@fire.ca.gov

Gary Fildes
Retired USDA Forest Service Prescribed Burn Manager
Yuba County resident
gfildes2001@yahoo.com

David Arsenault, Executive Director
Plumas Audubon Society
david@plumasaudubon.org

Robert K. Noxon, Battalion Chief
USDA Forest Service, Tahoe National Forest
rnoxon@fs.fed.us

Greg Suba
Conservation Program Director
California Native Plant Society
gsuba@cnps.org

Marko Bey, Executive Director
Lomakatsi Restoration Project
marko@lomakatsi.org

Dawn Pedersen
Registered Professional Forester
dawn.pedersen@fire.ca.gov

John Knight
Registered Professional Forester #2475
jpkdok@yahoo.com

David Murray, Fire Management Crew Boss
California State Parks
david.murray@parks.gov

Susan Britting, PhD
Sierra Forest Legacy
Britting@earthlink.net

Guy Duffner, Conservation Associate for Planning and Training
North America Fire Learning Network
gduffner@tnc.org

Zachary Anaya
The Wildlands Conservancy
zach.a@twc-ca.org

Southern California Edison – Forest Management Team
Key contact: Michael Esposito
michael.esposito@sce.com

Richard Bagley, President
Hwy 168 Fire Safe Council
richard.bagley@sce.com

Shaver Lake Volunteer Organization
Key contact: Dr. Rodney Wiens
rodney.wiens@sce.com
Defenders of Wildlife
Contact: Pamela Flick, California Representative
pflick@defenders.org

Kate Wilkin, PhD Candidate
Stephens Lab for Research and Education in Wildland Fire Sciences
UC Berkeley
kate.wilkin@berkeley.edu

Hugh Safford, PhD, Regional Ecologist
USDA Forest Service, Pacific Southwest Region
hughsaффord@fs.fed.us

Gabrielle Bohlman
UC Davis
gnbohlman@ucdavis.edu

Jens Stevens, Postdoctoral Researcher
UC Davis John Muir Institute of the Environment
jtstevens@ucdavis.edu

Kenneth C. Baldwin
CA Registered Professional Forester #1855
Baldwin, Blomstrom, Wilkinson & Associates Inc., Consulting Foresters
bravefriend@hotmail.com

Mark Rapp, Chair
Oregon Prescribed Fire Council
oregonrxfirecouncil@gmail.com

Lindsay Dailey, Wildlands Director
The Occidental Arts and Ecology Center
ldailey@oaec.org

Ali Freedlund
Working Lands and Human Communities Program Director
Mattole Restoration Council
ali@mattole.org

Emma Vakili, National President
Student Association for Fire Ecology
emma.vakili@colostate.edu

Michael D. Wheelock, Vice Chairman
Southern Oregon Prescribed Fire Network
mdwheelock@msn.com

Sean Hendrix, Base Manager (Merlin, OR)
Grayback Forestry, Inc.
sean@graybackforestry.com

Paul Carmichael, Fire Protection Officer
Nevada Division of Forestry
pcarmicheal@forestry.nv.gov

Heather Anuhea Kramer
University of California, Berkeley
anu.kramer@berkeley.edu

Erin Kelly, PhD
Humboldt State Department of Forestry
CA Registered Professional Forester #3001
eck107@humboldt.edu

Gabrielle Boisrame, Doctoral Candidate
UC Berkeley
gboisrame@gmail.com

Don Hankins, Associate Professor, CSU-Chico
Northern CA Prescribed Fire Council, Member
California Indian Water Commission, Member
Butte County Fire Safe Council, Secretary
Forest Ranch Fire Safe Council
dhankins@csuchico.edu

Dale Shippelhoute
North Central Valley Zone Fire Management Officer
US Fish and Wildlife Service
dale_shippelhoute@fws.gov

John R. Mount
Forester
mount.john@ymail.com

Anna Higgins, Research Assistant
University of Nevada, Reno
ahiggins@nevada.unr.edu
Bruce McLean, Founder
Forest Ranch Fire Safe Council
brucemclean.1@att.net

Marlene Fune
Forest Ranch Fire Safe Council
marlenefune@gmail.com

BlueRibbon Coalition
Key contact: Don Amador, Western Representative
brdon@sharetrails.org

Dorothy Goodyear, General Partner
Reading’s Creek Tree Farm
PO box 309, Weaverville, CA 96093

Travis Thane, Fire Management Specialist
USDA Forest Service, Eldorado National Forest
tthane@fs.fed.us

Jennifer Boyd, Retired Forest Fuels Officer
USDA Forest Service, Eldorado National Forest
r5jsboyd@gmail.com

Karen Derry
Karuk Community Development Corporation
kderry@karuk.us

Gail Goodyear
Trinity County resident
ggoodyear@hotmail.com